

ITALIAN VILLAGE COMMISSION MINUTES

Tuesday, June 16, 2015

6:00 p.m.

50 W. Gay St. – First Floor - Conference Room B

Commissioners Present: Todd Boyer, David Cooke, Rex Hagerling (arrived 6:08 p.m., during staff approvals), Josh Lapp, Jason Sudy (opened meeting in absence of Chair Hagerling), Charmaine Sutton (left 8:10 p.m.).

Commissioners Absent: Ben Goodman

City Staff Present: Connie Torbeck

- I. CALL TO ORDER (6:05 p.m.).
- II. NEXT COMMISSION MONTHLY BUSINESS MEETING – 12:00 p.m. (Noon), Tuesday, July 14, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room A.
- III. NEXT COMMISSION MEETING – 6:00 p.m., Tuesday, July 21, 2015 – 50 W. Gay Street, 1st Floor, Conference Room B.
- IV. SWEARING IN OF STAFF
- V. INTRODUCTION OF COMMISSIONERS PRESENT
- VI. APPROVAL OF MINUTES – Tuesday, May 19, 2015.
MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-0) APPROVED
- VII. STAFF APPROVALS
The Italian Village Commission hereby accepts all Staff Approved items (see below) into the formal record.
Votes are as indicated, with abstentions (if any) shown in brackets immediately following the specific application.
MOTION: Cooke/Boyer (6-0-0) APPROVED
- VIII. PUBLIC FORUM
- IX. OUTSTANDING FINAL REVIEWS/APPROVALS
 - **15-5-23**
1024 N. High Street
Elford Development (Applicant/Owner)
Following presentation of the staff report and discussion of the proposed change of paint color from from “red” to “dark grey,” a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.
Approve Application #15-5-23, 1024 North Fourth Street, as noted:
Paint Color
 - The color of the narrow vertical strip, and the narrow horizontal strip of brick on the south elevation of the Fireproof Building is to be a red brick color, as originally approved.
 - The paint color should match the existing, darker red “coating” on the south wall of the building, as closely as possible.
 - The existing non-coated/non-painted brick of the facade is to remain unpainted.
 - Paint color chip to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (6-0-0) APPROVED

- **15-4-14 (Parking Lot Landscape Plan)**

995 North Fourth Street

Brad Parish/Architectural Alliance (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-4-14, Commissioner Boyer noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room. Following the presentation by the Applicant, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-4-14, 995 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Modify Existing Front/East Parking Lot

- *Modify the existing front/east parking lot to conform to zoning code and Italian Village Guidelines.*
- *Front/east parking lot provides 22 parking spaces at 45 degree angle, entering from Punta Alley and exiting on Third Avenue.*
- *Applicant is to submit revised site plans to Historic Preservation Office staff, for final review and approval by Commissioner Sudy, based on discussion at the May 4, 2015 special meeting, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.*
- *Revised drawings should include, 1) a study of the locations of the bike parking, handicap parking, and scooter parking; 2) An increase in the area of landscaping, especially at the triangle corners; 3) Steel rather than aluminum fencing is preferred.*
- *The final design and materials for the patio area is not approved at this time.*

MOTION: Cooke/Goodman (3-0-1 [Boyer]) APPROVED

NO FOLLOW UP ACTION TAKEN

Revised site plan to be reviewed by Commissioner Sudy prior to the July 21st IVC hearing.

X. APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS

STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS

1. 15-6-10

819 Summit Street

Densil Porteous (Applicant)

Densil Porteous & Dewit Matthew (Owners)

Item #1 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Windows

2. 15-6-12

942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Clayton Toth/JVB Group, Inc. (Applicant)

Thomas A. Armistead (Owner)

Item #2 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Rebuild Front Porch Piers

3. 15-6-13

Multiple Locations

Short North Alliance (Applicant)

Multiple Owners (Owner)

Item #3 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install New Murals

HOLDOVERS

4. 15-4-20c

936 North Fourth Street

Nick Gore (Applicant/Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:
In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #15-4-20c, 936 North Fourth Street, for installation of new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 21, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Note: The Applicant attended the April 21, 2015 IVC meeting. It is the policy of the Italian Village Commission to remove an application from the agenda following three absences by the Applicant. Should the Applicant not be prepared to attend the July 21st IVC hearing, the application will be removed from the agenda, and submittal of a new application will be required to be placed on a future IVC agenda.

MOTION: Sudy/Cooke (6-0-0) CONTINUED

5. 15-4-29 (New Application/Exterior Alteration)

1044 North High Street

Brian Swanson (Applicant)

Fred Maloof (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:
In the absence of the Applicant, continue Application #15-4-29, 1044 North High Street, for installation of a new NanaWall system, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 21, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Note: The Applicant attended the April 21, 2015 IVC meeting. It is the policy of the Italian Village Commission to remove an application from the agenda following three absences by the Applicant. Should the Applicant not be prepared to attend the July 21st IVC hearing, the application will be removed from the agenda, and submittal of a new application will be required to be placed on a future IVC agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Sutton (6-0-0) CONTINUED

6. 15-5-17 (Variance Recommendation)

200 East Fourth Avenue

Andrew Losinske (Applicant)

Heidi Koestner (Owner)

Upon review of Application #15-5-17, 200 East Fourth Avenue, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

- 3312.49 – which requires a minimum number of parking spaces.
- Approximately forty spaces are required for the 3000 sq. ft. building.
- Three parking spaces exist behind the proposed restaurant, and eight spaces existing on the east side of the building.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (3-3[Cooke/Hagerling/Sutton – against]-0) APPROVAL NOT RECOMMENDED

7. 15-4-38

920 North High Street

Sketch Blue on behalf of Donatos (Applicant)

Emerald Light Investments, Ltd. (Owner)

Following the presentation of the Staff Report, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

In the absence of, and at the request of the Applicant, continue Application #15-4-38, 920 North High Street, for installation of new signage, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 21, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda for further review.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (6-0-0) CONTINUED

8. 15-6-16 (Conceptual Review)

930 & 940 North High Street

H. Christopher Friend/Schooley Caldwell Assoc. (Applicant) The Brunner Building, LLC (Owner)

New Construction

- Construct a new six (6) story, mixed use building, per the submitted drawings.
- First floor to be retail space fronting High Street.
- Second floor to be office space.
- Floors three through five to include ten (1) residential units each.
- The set back sixth floor to include two (2) penthouse suites and a clubhouse with rooftop terrace.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Asked about the lack of windows on the south elevation, which would be exposed adjacent to a shorter building.
- Does not have concerns about the proposed height.
- Thinks there is a good visual break between the second and third floors.
- Conceptually, the penthouse seems to be in the right direction. It is set back, and is not part of the visual datum line along the street.
- A 3-5 story building seems to work within this particular section of High Street.

David Cooke:

- Also glad to see the penthouse moved back.
- Is interested in the idea of etched or frosted glass, but this building seems to call for awnings, particularly over the retail. Perhaps have a different treatment at the apartment entrance.
- Will be interested in further details about the colors of the façade. Thinks the stone should be a somewhat darker color.
- Is in favor of the proposed office space use.
- Thinks the rear elevation details have an appropriate industrial feel.
- Would encourage using blank walls for murals.
- Encourages the applicants to look at the corner treatment.
- Would like to see brick and stone samples submitted next time.

Josh Lapp:

- Thinks the treatment between the first and second floors is successful and works well to diminish the height visually.

Charmaine Sutton:

- No comments to add.

Todd Boyer:

- The scale, proportion, and language is consistent and appropriate.
- With this kind of a detailed building, all the little pieces matter even more. Will need to pay attention to details of the storefront system to make sure that true contemporary materials aren't used that don't quite fit with the same language that has been established for the rest of the building.
- In general, is okay with the direction.

Rex Hagerling:

- Is struggling with the height a bit.
- Would like to see views down the street and streetscape comparisons with other existing and proposed buildings in the area.
- Finds the top and bottom to be a bit disjointed, like one building sitting on top of another.

- Currently, the proportion of the base seems a bit off.
- Likes seeing the penthouse has been moved back.

NO ACTION TAKEN

9. 15-6-17 (Variance Recommendation)

808 Summit Street

Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Marion Risberg (Owner)

Upon review of Application #15-6-17, 808 Summit Street, the Italian Village Commission recommends approval of the proposed variance, as follows:

Request for Variance Recommendation

To permit the existing parcel to be divided into two lots referred to herein as North Lot and South Lot:

1. 3332.039: (North & South Lots) To permit three dwelling units to be in two structures on one lot.

2. 3332.15:

North Lot: To permit three (3) dwelling units in two buildings to be situated on a lot which equals less than 2500 square feet per dwelling unit and to be 1466 square feet per unit and with the 3:1 requirement, 1024 square feet per unit.

South Lot: To permit three (3) dwelling units in two buildings to be situated on a lot which equals less than 2500 square feet per dwelling unit and to be 1635 square feet per unit and with the 3:1 requirement, 1225 square feet per unit.

3. 3332.19: (North & South Lots) To permit a dwelling to not front on a public street.

4. 3332.27:

North Lot: To permit a dwelling to have less than 25% rear yard and to have no rear yard.

South Lot: To permit a dwelling to have less than 25% rear yard and to have no rear yard; and to permit a principal building to have less than 25% rear yard and to have 22%.

5. 3332.28: (North and South Lots) To permit paved parking spaces to be part of the required rear yard calculation.

6. 3332.38(F): (North and South Lots) To permit the square footage of a private garage to exceed 720 square feet and be 840 square feet.

7. 3312.25: (North and South Lots) To permit maneuvering to occur in the area of a stacked parking space.

8. 3312.29: (North and South Lots) To permit 2 car stacked parking.

MOTION: Sudy/Lapp (6-2 [Hagerling/Sutton-against]-0 [Cooke-abstain]) APPROVAL RECOMMENDED

10. 15-6-18 (New Application)

808 Summit Street (formerly 808-810)

Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Marion Risberg (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Continue Application #15-6-18, 808 Summit Street, for new construction, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

David Cooke:

- Consider moving one of the entry doors from the north to the south elevation. Or, use one stoop and one door hood for the two doors on the north.
- The mix of one-over-one and two-over-one windows does not seem appropriate.
- Need information about window sills and/or lintels.

Rex Hagerling:

- Need additional details and drawings for the porch, including the soffit beam, cornice, and eaves. The porch roof seems too high.
- The second story windows seem high on the east and north elevations.
- Would be helpful to see streetscape drawing/photos with adjacent houses.
- Will want to make sure the house does not come too far out of the ground.
- Would like information regarding the relationship of floor to foundation height.

Josh Lapp:

- The placement and proportions of the windows seems a bit disjointed.

Jason Sudy:

- Consider dedicating a bit more space, into the lot, for possible widening of the sidewalk in the future.
- Would like to see existing trees retained, if possible.
- Would like additional information on the grade along Summit Street.
- Look at the height of the foundations on adjacent houses.

MOTION: Sudy/Sutton (6-0-0) CONTINUED

11. 15-6-19 (Conceptual Review)

848 Pearl Alley

Connie J. Klema, Attny. (Applicant)

Wood Run Partners, LLC (Owner)

New Construction

- Construct a new, five story building, per the submitted site plan and renderings.
- Exterior materials to include standing seam metal and cementitious panels, and ground-face, stack bond block.
- Windows and storefront systems to be aluminum.
- New building to include first floor parking space with painted, metal, barstock grating and aluminum and glass garage door.

Prior to review of Application #15-6-19, Commissioner Cooke noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room.

Following the presentation by the applicant, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- The proposed balconies are great.
- It is a contemporary building that has an interesting set of punctuation points, without overwhelming the whole.
- Appreciates the idea of how the art wall will function.
- The mixture of materials is great.
- This is a unique location. A larger building is being redeveloped across the street, and it is adjacent to a historic house that is much shorter. But, sees this as being in the High Street corridor, where there can be some building mass.
- Would like a closer look at how the corner will work with any ADA requirements. Would prefer to see a bit wider sidewalk.

Charmaine Sutton:

- Thinks that the building along Prescott sidewalk is still pushed out a bit too far. Wonders if changing balcony shape could solve the issue. Understands it has been pulled back, but would like to see more.

Josh Lapp:

- Bringing the building down one story and making the Pearl elevation more pedestrian are both great positives.
- Had questions about the use of ground face stack bond block on the west and east elevations rather than continuing the cementitious panels down farther.
- The balconies are great.

Todd Boyer:

- Encourages the Applicant to be more free with the use of art on the ground floor rather than allocating it to the corner.
- The balconies on Prescott and Pearl add a playfulness. Would like to see more on the other side.
- If the mansard roof is kept, would like to see it turn around the south side. It's a unique piece, so would like to see it continued like the porches on the other side.

- Has some concerns about the use of cementitious board on this scale of a building. It can have a lack of permanence and authority. There is a lot of detail that goes with it. It can look cheap if not done well.

Rex Hagerling:

- Also is concerned that the details of the exterior materials need to be done well.
- Is not in favor of a building this large on this side of Pearl Street, but appreciates the changes that have been made since the last review.

Following the above noted discussion, at the request of the Applicant, a motion for Conditional Approval was made, and votes recorded, as noted:

Based on the revised drawings submitted for the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting, the Italian Village Commission grants Conditional Approval for Application 15-6-19, 848 Pearl Alley, for the proposed new construction, including the overall design, footprint, height, and massing with the following conditions:

- All final details to return to the Italian Village Commission for final review and approval, including, but not limited to, building materials, lighting, landscaping, and signage.

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (3-2[Hagerling/Sutton-against]-0[Cooke-abstain])

12. 15-6-20 (Conceptual Review)

963 North Sixth Street

Mulberry Design + Build, LLC (Applicant)

Autumnwood Homes, Inc. (Owner)

Application #15-6-20, 963 North Sixth Street, for demolition and new construction, was withdrawn from the agenda by the Applicant, prior to the June 16th meeting. Submission of a new application is required to be placed on a future Italian Village Commission agenda.

NO ACTION REQUIRED

13. 15-6-21 (Conceptual Review)

1050 & 1086 North Fourth Street

Tim Lai/Tim Lai ArchitecT (Applicant)

1086 N. Fourth Street LS LLC (Owner)

Demolition

- Demolish the one (1) existing, brick warehouse building located immediately adjacent to the rear of the two-story Budd Dairy building. Demolish the roof only of the next warehouse building to the east.
- Demolish the existing concrete block building at 1050 North Fourth Street.
- Demolish the existing, concrete block shed on E. Fourth Ave.
- Remove the existing billboard at N. Fourth St. and E. Greenwood Ave.

New Construction

- Retain and rehab the two, existing warehouses and courtyard at the east end of the property; to include approximately thirty (30) dwelling units and twenty-four (24) parking spaces.
- Construct four (4) new buildings, per the submitted site plan and renderings.
- New construction to include approximately 114 dwelling units, retail, and office space.

Following the presentation by the applicants, Chairperson Hagerling opened the discussion, and the following observations were made regarding the proposed project to assist the Applicant/Owner in preparing for further review at a future IVC hearing.

Commissioner Comments

Jason Sudy:

- Very relieved that the Applicant has taken a new direction and will be preserving the Budd Dairy warehouses.
- Could be supportive of the demolition of the 1960s garage and the proposed open-air parking within the 1949 warehouse. Will be important to wrap the corner with the wall.

- Although retaining exterior walls only is not a general preservation practice, this particular warehouse is fire damaged, and retaining the overall north elevation of the multiple warehouses is more important than the building behind it.
- Will need to start considering any type and location of fencing within the development.
- Thinks that any parking near Fourth Street can be resolved with appropriate screening.
- Following the Commission's interior/exterior site visit of the buildings on May 4th, feels comfortable with the demolition of the Durable Slate building.
- Thinks the proposed scale for the overall development is appropriate. The phasing is smart.
- Take another look at moving the garage entrance from Detroit Avenue to the alley.

Josh Lapp:

- Will be interested to see the details of how the north elevation walls of the warehouses will work together.
- Glad to know the warehouses will be saved. Feels good about the new direction of the development.
- Consider reusing some of the brick from the demolished building for paving. Consider paving materials other than concrete or asphalt for parking areas, if possible.

David Cooke:

- The north wall provides a good opportunity to provide some history of the building through art or photography.
- Could support the demolition of the Durable Slate building, but would want the stone lintels to be retained and reused in some capacity.
- Thinks it is critical to move the garage entrance from Detroit Avenue around to the alley. Curb cuts belong on the alleys and not on main streets.
- Thrilled that the warehouses will be saved.
- Would not want to see a series of new doorfronts where they did not exist before.

Todd Boyer:

- No additional comments.

Charmaine Sutton:

- No additional comments.

Rex Hagerling:

- In basic agreement with comments of fellow commissioners.
- The demolition of the Durable Slate building is contingent upon what would replace it. Need more details regarding that proposed building. Agrees that there needs to be an expression of the stone pieces on the front of the existing building.
- Will be interested in the details of the building to be used for open-air parking.

NO ACTION TAKEN

14. 15-6-22

933 Hamlet Street

Jason Kentner (Applicant)

St. Joseph Montessori School (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-6-22, Commissioners Sudy and Sutton noted the need to abstain from the proceedings and exited the room.

Following the presentation by the Applicants, and additional discussion and review, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated.

Approve Application #15-6-22, 933 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Install Playground Equipment

- Install new zip lines, monkey bars, balance beams, climbing walls, and slides, per the submitted site plan and photo renderings.
- Install three swing sets I pea-gravel area.

Install New Running Track

- Install a new running track, per the submitted site plan.

Install Multi-Sport Field and Multi-Game Court

- Install new sport field and game court within the perimeter running track.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (4-0-2[Sudy/Sutton]) APPROVED

15. 15-6-15a

898 Hamlet Street

Allan Hurtt (Applicant/Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-6-15a, Commissioner Sutton returned to the table. Commissioners Sudy and Cooke abstained and remained out of the room.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Continue Application #15-6-15a, 898 Hamlet Street, for a new addition, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

Todd Boyer:

- At the previous meeting, a door hood was suggested for over the first floor rear doors, not over the second floor rear doors. Would not be in favor of a door hood over the second floor doors, unless it became a sleeping porch.
- Look at making the balcony serve as a roof over the first floor rear doors.
- The Commission understood that the three roof sections would have different pitches, but there needs to be some sort of true separation between the existing house and the new addition, to differentiate between the original house and the addition, and the roof is the vehicle to show that separation.

Rex Hagerling:

- Sliding glass doors would not be an appropriate. French doors or an accordion style door may be appropriate. Would need to see more information on the specific doors.

Charmaine Sutton:

- The same type of doors should be used on both the first and second floor.

MOTION: Lapp/Sutton (4-0-2[Cooke/Sudy-abstain]) CONTINUED

16. 15-5-22

995 North Fourth Street

Brad Parish/Architectural Alliance (Applicant)

Capitol Equities (Owner)

Prior to review of Application #15-5-22, Commissioners Cooke and Sudy returned to the table.

Following the presentation by the Applicant, Application #15-5-22 was divided into Items 'a' and 'b' for clarity of action. Motions were made, votes taken, and results recorded as indicated.

15-5-22a

Approve Application #15-5-22a, 995 North Fourth Street, as noted:

Renovations to Brick Building

- Paint previously painted exterior walls. Paint color chips to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- Repair existing windows, as noted on the drawings submitted at the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting.
- Install new all wood (interior/exterior) windows, as noted on the drawings submitted at the June 16, 2015 Italian Village Commission meeting.
- Size of existing window openings to remain, as is. Cut sheets for new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Install new storefront and aluminum/glass overhead door on the front/east elevation.

New Addition

- Construct a new addition at the rear of the existing brick building, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new fiber cement board siding on rear and side elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Foundation to be painted CMU.

- Final colors for siding to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation.
- Install new aluminum/glass overhead door and flush, metal door on the rear/west elevation.

Install New Patio

- Install a new outdoor seating area, per the submitted site plan.
- Patio floor to be stamped concrete in running bond pattern.
- Install new wrought iron fence, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new, wood trellis, per the submitted site plan.

Renovations to Concrete Block Building

- Paint previously painted, exterior concrete block walls, and install new horizontal, corrugated metal siding and EIFS, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new metal canopies, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings. No brake metal is to be used.
- Install new aluminum storefront windows and doors, as noted on all elevations, per the submitted drawings.
- Install new signage on east, north, and west elevations.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1[Boyer]) APPROVED

15-5-22b

Continue Application #15-5-22b, 995 North Fourth Street, for review of the west parking lot, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 21, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

MOTION: Cooke/Lapp (5-0-1[Boyer]) CONTINUED

17. 15-6-24

No Address (formerly 1066-1068 Hamlet/SE Corner of Detroit and Hamlet)

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)

Commissioner Sutton left the meeting prior to review of Application # 15-6-24. Following the presentation by the Applicants, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Approve Application #15-6-24, formerly 1066-1068 Hamlet/SE Corner of Detroit and Hamlet, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Construction

- Construct a new, two-story, four unit, wood frame townhome building with detached, four space garage.
- Exterior siding to be 6" fiber cement, lap siding.
- Windows to be aluminum-clad wood, one-over-one, double-hung windows.
- Cut sheets for windows, doors, and exterior lighting to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) APPROVED

18. 15-6-25

1171-1175 Summit Street

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant)

Detroit LLC/Lykens Companies (Owner)

Following the presentation by the Applicant, a motion was made, vote taken, and results recorded as indicated:

Continue Application #15-6-25, 1171-1175 Summit Street, for new construction, and direct Historic Preservation Office staff to place on the July 21, 2015 Italian Village Commission agenda.

Commissioner Comments:

Jason Sudy:

- Would need to see this building in context with the Burwell Heights building to understand it better.
- This building has some of the characteristics of some buildings on Fifth Avenue near High St, but without the characteristic first floor. The historic character is lost at the base of the building.
- Not opposed to retail space at this location, but thinks there needs to be some sort of base.

- Not sure that the top of the building works with the adjacent house. Thinks the previously reviewed design fit better into the fabric of the neighborhood.
- Is okay with the project going forward in phases.

David Cooke:

- Has some concerns that if the future Burwell Heights building is never built, the Burwell Station would be too big and out of character.
- Thinks it is too much out of the ground, and doesn't think all of the proposed cornice is needed.
- Suggests removing any signage from drawings until tenants are ready to submit actual signage proposals.

Josh Lapp:

- Does not have concerns with the height, but has concerns with the storefronts extending all the way to the ground.
- Maybe having the first floor partially below-grade would help with any overall height issues.
- Thinks the building looks good on its own, but has some concerns about first floor details.

Todd Boyer:

- Can see this building in the context with Burwell Heights, but would be concerned with a historic looking building standing alone if the rest of the development is not built.

Rex Hagerling:

- Likes the stairway in the center. Thinks it is pushed up a bit too high.
- Understands the need to proceed in phases.

MOTION: Cooke/Sudy (5-0-0) CONTINUED

19. 15-6-26 (Conceptual)

901 North Fourth Street

Karrick Sherrill/Shremshock Architects (Applicant) Chad Seiber/Mulberry Design Build, LLC (Owner)

Application #15-6-26, 901 North Fourth Street, for demolition and new construction, was withdrawn from the agenda by the Applicant, prior to the June 16th meeting. Submission of a new application is required to be placed on a future Italian Village Commission agenda.

NO ACTION REQUIRED

20. 15-6-27 (Staff Recommendation)

245 East Second Avenue

Dan Schmidt/JDS Companies (Applicant)

JDS Jeffrey, LLC (Owner)

Item #20 has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, below).

Install Artwork Murals

STAFF APPROVALS

• 15-6-1

1088-1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Richard Dietz (Applicant)

Jim Daley (Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-1, 1088-1090 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the main roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer's specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a "W" channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.

- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Certain Teed (standard 3-tab), “Nickel Gray.”
- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

• **15-6-2**

236 East Second Avenue

Kristina Keeling (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-2, 236 East Second Avenue, for renewal of expired COA # 13-7-8 (Expired: July 5, 2014), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the house, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged and deteriorated metal valleys with new metal valleys of appropriate dimension, as necessary. Valleys are to be smooth not a “W” channel to maintain the appropriate historic appearance and profile.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing on all existing chimneys.
- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be selected by the owner from the following approved shingles list:

Manufacturer:
[] CertainTeed

Style:
Carriage House (dimensional)

Color:
[] Stonegate Gray

[] GAF

Slateline (dimensional)

[] English Gray Slate
[] Weathered Slate

[] Certain Teed

(standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

[] GAF

Royal Sovereign (standard 3-tab)

[] Nickel Gray

[] Owens Corning

(standard 3-tab)

[] Estate Gray

[] Tamko

(standard 3-tab)

[] Antique Slate

- All ridges to be capped with galvanized metal ridge roll, in lieu of cut shingle tabs, and painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Upon completion, all metal valleys and flashing are to be painted “gray” or “Tinner’s Red.”
- Any/all necessary venting is to be performed on the roof ridge, underneath the metal ridge roll via CobraVent, VentSure, or comparable, in lieu of hat-vents and/or soffit vents.

Repair Exterior Door

- Make any/all necessary repairs to the existing, contributing, wooden door on the front elevation, per industry standards.
- All new wood to be of exact same profile and dimension as the original door panels, stiles, and rails; like-for-like.

- Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.

Install New Storm Doors

- Install new, Larson, aluminum, full-view, clear glass storm doors on the front and rear elevations.
- Cut sheet and color chip for the new storm door to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation of the door.

Install New Storm Windows

- Install new, low profile, metal storm windows on all windows, as needed.
- New storm windows to be installed inside the existing window frame.
- Storm window color to match the primary trim color as closely as possible.
- Double caulk to provide air-tight installation on top and sides. Do not caulk breather holes.
- Horizontal bar on all new storm windows to align with horizontal sash bar on existing windows.
- Storm windows to operate smoothly.
- All work to be in accordance with the performance manual.

- **15-6-3**

158 East Fourth Avenue

R. Hunter Willett (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-3, 158 East Fourth Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Patio

- Remove the existing concrete pavers from the rear yard.
- Install new, approximately 208 sq. ft., Unilock, Thornbury “Bavarian” pavers with dark charcoal paver border, per the submitted product cut sheets.
- Install Brussels Block retaining wall at the edge of the new patio to accommodate the change in elevation between the patio and fence, per the submitted site plan and product cut sheet.

Repair Existing Gate

- Replace six gate boards to extend the gate to ground level. New wood to match existing, like-for-like.

- **15-6-4**

830 Summit Street

Jeremy Marks (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-4, 830 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Platform Deck

- Remove the existing, deteriorated, 14’ x 14’, platform deck, and build a new platform deck in the same location, per the submitted drawing.
- New deck to measure 16’ x 19’. Height of deck floor to match height of existing deck floor. Balustrade/railings on new deck to match balustrade/railings on existing deck.

Repair/Replace Cellar Stairwell Walls

- Repair or replace the existing concrete, cellar stairwell walls, as needed.
- All work to be in accordance with all applicable Columbus City Building Codes and industry standards.

Install New Privacy Fence

- Remove the existing, rear yard, wood, privacy fence and install a new six-foot high (6’ H), rear yard, wood privacy fence. Site plan for location of all fencing and gates to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to installation of new fence.
- Style of the new wood fence is to be selected from one (1) of the following appropriate options: a) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6’ H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence, with finished side out, facing the neighboring properties (i. e. all stringers and posts placed on the inside); b) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6’ H), straight-cut or dog-eared (not stockade) wood fence with vertical 1” x 6” boards placed on both sides of the stringers; or c) Board-on-board, six-feet high (6’ H), wood fence with all straight-cut vertical boards installed with a top and bottom rail cap placed between the 4” x 4” wood posts.

- Fence to be painted or stained within one (1) year. Stain/paint color for all fence to be submitted to the Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.

- **15-6-5**

1208 North High Street

Christopher Bruzzese/Berardi + Partners (Applicant)

Community Housing Network (Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-5, 1208 North High Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair/Replace Trim

- Repair/replace the existing, storm damaged, plywood and trim in spandrel panels.
- Remove the remainder of the non-original, storm damaged, sheet metal from the sign band.
- Repair storm damaged sign band, as needed, and install new, wood trim, per the submitted elevation and section drawings.

Note: COA # 15-6-5 is a follow-up to work required by COA #14-9-6, issued 9-5-2015).

- **15-6-6**

1180 North Pearl Street

Randy Hartmeyer/SBA Network Services (Applicant) Stickmen Properties, Ltd. (Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-6, 1180 North Pearl Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Telecommunications Equipment

- Remove six (6) antennas and install six (6) new antennas, per the submitted drawings.
- Install two (2) new non-penetrating roof sleds.
- Remove three (3) RRH's on existing pole, and install nine new (9) RRH's on roof sleds.
- Remove one (1) existing OVP on pole and install two (2) new OVP's on roof sled.
- Install hybrid cables to OVP's.

- **15-6-7**

1031 North Fourth Street

Lauren Culley (Applicant)

Carol Guiler (Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-7, 1031 North Fourth Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Patio

- Install a new patio along the west side of the Fox in the Snow, per the submitted site plan.
- Install new patio fencing; planter boxes and plantings; and counter and benches, per the submitted drawings, fence design, and fence color.
- Install one (1) new 3' x 7' pre-finished, aluminum entry door on the west elevation, per the submitted drawing.

Note: COA # 15-6-7 approves final details for a new patio, as approved with COA # 15-3-9/fence (3-17-2015) and COA# 15-3-8/variance recommendation (3-17-2015).

- **15-6-8 [Cooke]**

Southeast Corner- E. First Ave. & North Fourth St. (Jeffrey Manufacturing Site)

Dave Perry (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC (Owner)

Approve Application # 15-6-8, Southeast Corner- E. First Ave. & North Fourth St. (Jeffrey Manufacturing Site), with all clarifications, as noted:

Site Compliance Plan

- Approve the final site compliance plan for Jeffrey Park, Phase 2, Community Center, per the submitted site plan, dated May 27, 2015.

Note: COA # 15-6-8 modifies COA # 13-11-18b.

- **15-6-9**

24 East Third Avenue

Citrine Rentals (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-8, 24 East Third Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Repair/Replace Concrete Front & East Porch Decks and Steps

- Repair or replace the existing, non-original concrete slab porch deck, and concrete steps, and install new concrete porch deck and concrete steps, as needed, like-for-like, and in accordance with all applicable city code.
- Replace any/all missing or damaged material on the rock-faced concrete block foundation and piers, and replace with new or used rock-faced concrete block of the exact same shape, dimension, and color; like-for-like.
- Use hand tools to remove any/all loose mortar to a depth of ¾”.
- Moisten surface with water, and spot point as needed with mortar of matching color, texture, hardness, and joint profile.
- New mortar must be softer than the masonry, and no harder than the historic mortar, to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

Repair Masonry Chimney

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with brick that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).
- All existing clay chimney pots to remain, as is.

Repair Concrete Block Garage

- Remove all defective material. Replace any/all damaged and missing brick with concrete block that matches the original material in size, shape, color, and texture.
- New mortar must be no harder than the historic mortar to allow for expansion and contraction of the masonry. Original mortar mix was composed of 1 part lime to 2 parts sand. White portland cement may be substituted for up to (but no more than) 20 percent of the lime content. (The owner is advised to use the approved 12 parts sand-4 parts lime-1 part white portland cement formula approved by the National Trust For Historic Preservation. Please refer to Preservation Brief 2- “Repointing Mortar in Historic Masonry Buildings” <http://www.nps.gov/tps/how-to-preserve/briefs/2-repoint-mortar-joints.htm>).

- **15-6-11 [Sudy]**

910-912 Hamlet Street

Christopher M. Hammer (Applicant/Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-11, 910-912 Hamlet Street, for renewal of expired COA # 13-5-1 (Expired: April 11, 2014), exactly as previously approved, for a period of one (1) year.

Remove and Install New Asphalt Shingle Roof – Rear Porch

- Remove all asphalt shingles on the rear porch roof, down to the sheathing. Dispose of all debris according to Columbus City Code.
- Replace any/all damaged, deteriorated, and missing sheathing with wood of appropriate dimension, as necessary.
- Install new, 30 lb. felt paper on all sheathing according to manufacturer’s specifications.
- Replace any/all damaged metal flashing.

- Install new 235 lb., class C, self-sealing 3-tab shingles. Manufacturer and color to be Owens Corning, standard 3-tab, “Estate Gray,” to match existing shingles on the main body of the house.
- Upon completion, all flashing to be painted “Tinner’s Red” or “Gray” to match ridge roll, metal valleys, and flashing on the main body of the house.

- **15-6-14**

1119 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Jason Kentner (Applicant)

Rhome Ruanphae (Owner)

Approve Application 15-6-14, 1119 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Landscaping

- Plant new, English Ivy “living fence” along alley between office lot and adjacent post office loading dock, per the submitted site plan and rendering.
- Install new flowering shrub/hedge along south side of existing permeable paving, per the submitted site plan. Planting material along north side to be determined.
- Install new shade tree (in basket) on north side of building, per the submitted site plan and rendering.

- **15-6-15b [Sudy/Cooke/Sutton]**

898 Hamlet Street

Allan Hurtt (Applicant/Owner)

Application #15-6-15 has been divided into item ‘a’ for Italian Village Commission review under New Applications (see above), and item ‘b’ for Staff Approval under Staff Approved items.

Approve Application 15-6-15b, 898 Hamlet Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Exterior Painting/House & Garage

- Repair and/or replace all damaged, deteriorated, and missing wood trim elements, as necessary. All replacement wood to be of exact same dimension and profile as the original wood trim; like-for-like, according to industry standards.
- Prepare all exterior, wooden surfaces on the frame house and garage for repainting using the appropriate hand tools.
- Glaze and caulk as necessary.
- Prime all new and bare wood surfaces with the appropriate exterior primer according to manufacturer’s specifications. Paint color chips for finish coat are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of the paint.
- **Any previously unpainted, masonry (i.e., brick/stone/concrete sills, lintels, porch columns, etc.) is to remain unpainted.**
- **Any previously painted masonry is to be left as is, or be painted to match the original color of the unpainted masonry as closely as possible.**
- Paint color chips for any previously painted masonry are to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval, prior to application of paint.

Repair Slate Roof

- Replace any/all missing, damaged, and deteriorated slate on the main roof of the house with new or used slate of the exact same color and profile and in accordance with all applicable City Code and industry standards.

Foundation Repair

- Remove any/all damaged material and replace with like-for-like materials, like-for-like. Replacement stone to match existing in size, color, and shape. Mortar to match existing mortar in color, texture, hardness, and joint profile. The height, thickness, and length of the masonry wall is to remain the same following the completion of all repairs.

- **15-6-23**

17 East Brickel Street

Jami Gray (Applicant)

NAI Ohio Equities (Owner)

An application, photographs, and drawings have been submitted. Request for approval of the awnings, as shown on the drawings, has been withdrawn.

Approve Application 15-6-23, 17 East Brickel Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

New Signage

- Install one (1) new, non-illuminated, projecting sign, per the submitted drawings.
- Bracket to be ¼" thick aluminum painted "Matthews Matte Black."
- New sign to be a 4" deep, aluminum, fabricated, blade sign.
- Faces to be painted "Matthews Satin White."
- Returns to be painted to match, PMS 661C.
- Icon to be ¼" thick PVC, painted to match, "BM Oxford White," and mounted flush to blade sign.
- Sign to be mounted to existing brick wall. All fasteners to be inserted into mortar rather than into the face of the brick.
- New sign to be located to the right of the front entrance.

- **15-6-10**

819 Summit Street

Densil Porteous (Applicant)

Densil Porteous & Dewit Matthew (Owners)

Converted to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application 15-6-10, 819 Summit Street, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Install New Windows

- Remove existing, wood, one-over-one and two-over-two, double-hung sash windows, as noted per the Historic Preservation Office staff June 3, 2015 site visit. Non-deteriorated windows will be retained and repaired, as needed.
- Install new, all wood (interior/exterior) one-over-one and two-over-two, double-hung sash windows. The size of all window openings to remain, as is.
- Cut sheets for all new windows to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for final review and approval.
- Applicant has the option of retaining the Chicago-style window on the façade, or replacing it with two (2) two-over-two, double-hung sash windows, to match those on the second story.

- **15-6-12**

942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue

Clayton Toth/JVB Group, Inc. (Applicant)

Thomas A. Armistead (Owner)

Converted to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting.

Approve Application 15-6-12, 942 Mt. Pleasant Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:

Rebuild Front Porch Piers

- Remove existing rock-faced, concrete block, front porch piers.
- Install new, Cantelli, rock-faced, concrete block front porch piers, per the submitted example photograph.
- New concrete block to be stained to diminish the brightness of the new block and suggest the aged color of the existing original concrete block. Method and color of staining to be submitted to Historic Preservation Office staff for the file.

Note: Approval of a modified style for the new piers is based on currently available materials.

- **15-6-13**
Multiple Locations
Short North Alliance (Applicant) **Multiple Owners (Owner)**
Converted to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting.
Approve Application 15-6-13, Multiple Locations, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:
Install New Murals
 - Installation of temporary murals at multiple locations for the ‘Short North Arts District Mini Mural’ program for 2015. Locations on file at the Historic Preservation Office.
 - Murals are high resolution photographs of works of art transferred to a vinyl material, printed, and heat-adhered to the exterior wall of the buildings.
 - Murals to be installed for a period of approximately 12-18 months, and range in size from approximately 8’ x 8’ to 12’ x 20’.
 - Any future new murals and/or mural locations to return to the Italian Village Commission for review and approval.

- **15-6-28**
283-323 East First Avenue
Rob Harris (Applicant) **Jeffrey New Day, LLC.**
Converted to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting.
Approve Application 15-6-28, 283-323 East First Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:
Modify Previous Approval/First Floor Terrace Railings
 - Modify the previously approved terrace railings with openings (as shown in submitted photos) to terrace railings without an opening.
 - Applicant has the option to install continuous railings or to railings with gates.

- **15-6-27**
245 East Second Avenue
Dan Schmidt/JDS Companies (Applicant) **JDS Jeffrey, LLC (Owner)**
Converted to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting.
Approve Application 15-6-27, 245 East Second Avenue, as submitted, with all clarifications, as noted:
Install Artwork Murals
 - Install new artwork murals on the south and north walls of the “Battery B” building, per the submitted photo renderings.
 - Murals to be hand painted onto the stucco surface.

Note: Murals were encouraged by the Commission during original reviews of the new construction.

XI. OLD BUSINESS

15-6-28 (Staff Recommendation)
283-323 East First Avenue

Rob Harris (Applicant)

Jeffrey New Day, LLC.

This Old Business item has been moved to the Staff Approved applications following presentation by Historic Preservation Office Staff at the June 9th, 2015 IVC Business Meeting (See Staff Approvals, above).

Modify Previous Approval/First Floor Terrace Railings

XII. NEW BUSINESS

- Brief discussion of sidewalks fronting 163-177 Punta Alley.
 - HPO staff presented photographs submitted by property owners along Punta Alley. The Commission noted the overall goal of making the village a more walkable and pedestrian friendly area, and would, therefore, not be in favor of removing any sidewalks to be replaced with planting areas.

XIII. ADJOURNMENT

MOTION: Sudy/Boyer (5-0-0) ADJOURNED (8:53 p.m.)